FORENSIC ENGINEERING 2022

Collaborative Reporting for Safer Structures

SELECTED PAPERS FROM THE NINTH CONGRESS ON FORENSIC ENGINEERING

> November 4–7, 2022 Denver, Colorado

SPONSORED BY Forensic Engineering Division of the American Society of Civil Engineers

> EDITED BY Rui Liu, Ph.D., P.E. Carmen C. Mulea, P.E. M. Kevin Parfit, P.E. Tara L. Cavalline, Ph.D., P.E.



Published by the American Society of Civil Engineers

Published by American Society of Civil Engineers 1801 Alexander Bell Drive Reston, Virginia, 20191-4382 www.asce.org/publications | ascelibrary.org

Any statements expressed in these materials are those of the individual authors and do not necessarily represent the views of ASCE, which takes no responsibility for any statement made herein. No reference made in this publication to any specific method, product, process, or service constitutes or implies an endorsement, recommendation, or warranty thereof by ASCE. The materials are for general information only and do not represent a standard of ASCE, nor are they intended as a reference in purchase specifications, contracts, regulations, statutes, or any other legal document. ASCE makes no representation or warranty of any kind, whether express or implied, concerning the accuracy, completeness, suitability, or utility of any information, apparatus, product, or process discussed in this publication, and assumes no liability therefor. The information contained in these materials should not be used without first securing competent advice with respect to its suitability for any general or specific application. Anyone utilizing such information assumes all liability arising from such use, including but not limited to infringement of any patent or patents.

ASCE and American Society of Civil Engineers-Registered in U.S. Patent and Trademark Office.

Photocopies and permissions. Permission to photocopy or reproduce material from ASCE publications can be requested by sending an e-mail to permissions@asce.org or by locating a title in ASCE's Civil Engineering Database (http://cedb.asce.org) or ASCE Library (http://ascelibrary.org) and using the "Permissions" link.

Errata: Errata, if any, can be found at https://doi.org/10.1061/9780784484555

Copyright © 2022 by the American Society of Civil Engineers. All Rights Reserved. ISBN 978-0-7844-8455-5 (PDF) Manufactured in the United States of America.

Preface

The Forensic Engineering Congress is organized by ASCE's Forensic Engineering Division and is held every three years to disseminate information on building and civil infrastructure failures and to discuss the application of engineering principles to the investigation of failures and other performance problems. The Congress provides a platform for forensic experts from various disciplines to share their knowledge and experience, to network, and to learn from others involved in the discipline.

In mid-2020 the organizers of the 9th Congress contacted us as the Directors of Collaborative Reporting for Safer Structures – US to invite CROSS-US to participate in the Congress. We enthusiastically accepted the invitation and engaged our CROSS colleagues within and outside the US to prepare the nine papers that comprise this Volume 2 of the proceedings.

Established in the UK in 2005 as Confidential Reporting on Structural Safety, CROSS encourages individuals to submit through a confidential and secure internet portal reports on structural failures, near misses, and general safety concerns. The reports are anonymized and then forwarded to CROSS's Expert Panel for input on lessons learned and recommendations to improve practice. The Expert Panel commentary is compiled, summarized, and appended to the anonymized report, and the resulting final report is posted on-line, where it is available to all for the benefit of improving structural safety. Since 2005 the CROSS system has accepted over 1000 reports, and it has been shown to have a very direct, positive influence on safety practices and culture in the UK. In the seventeen years since its inception, CROSS has flourished and expanded internationally. CROSS-Australasia was established in 2018 and CROSS-US in 2019.

Enquiries into the tragic fire at Grenfell Tower in London in 2017 highlighted the importance of fire safety in our structures and the value of the CROSS system in promoting a safety culture. The UK government supported the strengthening of the CROSS infrastructure and its expansion into fire safety in CROSS-UK.

The nine papers of this volume track the founding and development of CROSS in the UK, its expansion internationally, and its expansion to fire safety. The papers include contributions from the UK, Australasia, the US, and Germany, and span both structural and fire safety. CROSS's unique role in our system of assuring structural safety is described, and its tremendous potential for even greater impact internationally is envisioned.

All abstracts and manuscripts submitted to the 9th Forensic Engineering Congress were peerreviewed, with each paper receiving a minimum of two positive reviews to be accepted for presentation and publication. Reviewers applied the following review criteria:

- Is the submission applicable and relevant to forensic engineering?
- Is the paper original for its publication in the Congress?
- Are the methods of forensic investigation or research satisfactorily explained?
- Are the tables, figures, and photographs included in the submission clear and necessary?
- Are the conclusions clear and supported by the discussion and evidence?

iii

- Are the references verifiable?
- Is the paper logically structured?
- Are the writing style, grammar, and formatting appropriate according to ASCE publication guidelines?

We thank the organizers of the Congress, particularly Rui Liu, Carmen Mulea, Kevin Parfitt, and Tara Cavalline, as well as other members of the Steering Committee, for inviting CROSS-US to participate in the Congress. The collaboration between the ASCE Forensic Division and ASCE/SEI/CROSS-US has flourished in the two years since that initial outreach. We thank the. Reviewers for their thoughtful reviews and comments on the draft manuscripts. Jay Snyder, Senior Manager, Committee on Technical Advancement of ASCE, provided constant encouragement, guidance, and coordination between the editorial board and ASCE since the planning phase of the Congress. And, we want to thank the ASCE team from Conferences, Sponsorship, and Publications for their support during the Congress planning process. We want to acknowledge Erin Ryan, project manager of Omnipress, for her assistance in managing the abstracts and manuscripts submissions, peer reviews, and coordinating communications between the authors and the conference steering committee. The CROSS Executive Committee, particularly its Secretary, Laura Champion, provided invaluable support and advice for these nine papers.

While the initiation and development of CROSS involved the teamwork and support of many, Alastair Soane is the recognized founder of the CROSS system and has been its driving force for the last seventeen years. For his foresight, professionalism, and unwavering energy we dedicate this Volume 2 of the proceedings to him.

Glenn Bell and Andrew Herrmann

Directors, CROSS-US

Forensic Engineering 2022

Acknowledgements

Steering Committee

- Carmen Mulea, P.E., M.ASCE, Principal, Engineered Building Solutions, Inc. Chair of Congress Steering Committee
- o Ronald W. Anthony, Aff.M.ASCE, Principal, Anthony & Associates Inc.
- Hossein Ataei, Ph.D., P.E., P.Eng, F.ASCE, Civil Engineering Faculty and Director of Construction Engineering and Management Program, University of Illinois at Chicago
- Paul A. Bosela Jr., P.E., LEED AP, Forensic Engineer, Bosela Forensic Engineering Consultants, LLC
- o Tara Cavalline, Ph.D., M.ASCE, Associate Professor, UNC Charlotte
- Alicia E. Diaz de Leon, P.E., R.A., S.E., M.ASCE, Principal, Drerup Building Performance Engineering, PLLC
- Michael J. Drerup, P.E., F.ASCE, Principal Engineer, Drerup Building Performance Engineering, PLLC
- o Anthony M. Dolhon, P.E., M.ASCE, Principal, Dolhon Forensics
- o Travis Gregory Ebisch, P.E., M.ASCE, Project Director, Nelson Forensics, LLC
- o Joshua B. Kardon, Ph.D., P.E., F.ASCE, Principal, Joshua B. Kardon and Co.
- o Michael P. Lester, P.E., M.ASCE, Principal, Element Analytical, PLLC
- Rui Liu, Ph.D., P.E., M.ASCE, Associate Professor, Kent State University, Chair of Congress Technical Program Committee
- o Navid Nastar, Ph.D., P.E., S.E., F.ASCE, Principal, Brandow & Nastar, Inc
- M. Kevin Parfitt, P.E., F. AEI, M. ASCE, Department of Architectural Engineering, The Pennsylvania State University
- Kevin L. Rens, Ph.D., P.E., M.ASCE, Chair and Professor, Civil Engineering, University of Colorado Denver
- o Ziad Mohammad Salameh, P.E., M.ASCE, Principal, ZS, LLC
- Maria Mirian Velay-Lizancos, Ph.D., A.M.ASCE, Assistant Professor, Lyles School of Civil Engineering, Purdue University
- o Wael A. Zatar, M.ASCE, Dean and Professor of Civil Engineering, Marshall University

Forensic Engineering Awards Committee

- Benjamin M. Cornelius, P.E., C.E., S.E., M. ASCE, Partner, LERA Consulting Structural Engineers
- o Navid Nastar, Ph.D., P.E., S.E., F.ASCE, Principal, Brandow & Nastar, Inc,
- o Clemens Rossell, P.E., M.ASCE, Facilities Structural Engineer, Boeing, Division

Executive Committee – ASCE Forensic Engineering Division

- Stewart M. Verhulst, Stewart Verhulst, P.E., RRC, M. ASCE, Vice President, Nelson Forensics, LLC. Division Chair
- Jason Dale Gregorie, P.E., M.ASCE, Jason D. Gregorie, PE, M.ASCE, Principal, Applied Building Sciences, Inc. Division Vice Chair
- Laura E Sullivan-Green, Ph.D., A.M.ASCE, Department Chair, Civil Engineering, San Jose State University
- o Richard S Barrow, P.E., S.I. M.ASCE, Owner, Barrow Engineering, LLC
- Benjamin M. Cornelius, P.E., C.E., S.E., M. ASCE, Partner, LERA Consulting Structural Engineers
- o Weijin Wang, Ph.D., P.E., M.ASCE, EFI Global, Inc.

Executive Committee – CROSS-US/ACSE-Structural Engineering Institute

- Glenn R. Bell, P.E., S.E., CEng (UK), F. SEI, Dist. M. ASCE, FIStructE, FICE, Glenn R. Bell Consulting
- Laura Champion, P.E., F.ASCE, F.SEI, Managing Director of SEI and Global Partnerships, ASCE
- o Andrew Herrmann, P.E., F.SEI, Pres.12. ASCE, Partner Emeritus, Hardesty and Hanover
- Norma Jean Mattei, PhD, P.E., Pres.17. ASCE, F.SEI, Professor, University of New Orleans, Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering
- Judith Mitrani-Reiser, PhD, M.ASCE, M.SEI, Senior Research Scientist, National Institute of Standards and Technology
- o Alastair Soane, PhD, CEng (UK), FICE, FIStructE, Principal Consultant, CROSS

John Tawresy, S.E., F.SEI, F.TMS, Hon.M.TMS, Dist. M. ASCE, Ret. CFO, KPFF Consulting 0 Engineers

Reviewers

Chase Anderson	Anurag Jain	Christine V
Ron Anthony	Ryan Kalina	John Wylie
Hossein Ataei	Joshua Kardon	Wael Zatar
Melissa Beauregard	Michael Lester	
Glenn Bell	Rui Liu	
Randall Bernhardt	Shalva Marjanishvili	
Paul Bosela Jr.	Nathan Mayercsik	
Paul Bosela Sr.	Mark Mistur	
Vincent Campisi	Judith Mitrani-Reiser	
Tara Cavalline	Leonard Morse-Fortier	
Sumanth Cheruku	Carmen Mulea	
John Cleary	Taraka Ravi Mullapudi	
John Cocca	Lameck Onsarigo	
Antonio de Luca	Jose Pacheco	
Alicia Díaz de León	M. Kevin Parfitt	
David Dinehart	David Peraza	
Anthony Dolhon	Amanda Ramirez	
Justin Donaldson	Kevin Rens	
Michael Drerup	Elwin Robison	
Travis G. Ebisch	David Roueche	
Bobby Funcik	Evgenia Sideri	
Jose Gomez	Moutz Slim	
Jason Gregorie	Lloyd Sonenthal	
Tong Guo	Christian C. Steputat	
Phil Hailes	James Triano	
James Harris	Theodore von Rosenvinge	
Charles Hubbard	Kyle Wieghaus	

Wittich ie r

vii

Contents

The Decade of Disaster1 Glenn R. Bell
The Formation, Development, and Future of CROSS12 Alastair Soane
CROSS Influence on Codes and Standards of Practice
Enhanced and Expanded CROSS
Development of CROSS in the United States
Structural Safety and Failure Case Studies in Germany
Development of CROSS in Australasia
Confidential Reporting for Fire Safety64 Neil Gibbins
The Need for Fire Safety Performance-Based Design in an Increasingly Prescriptive Environment